Gaps in Balochistan Education Sector Plan in relation 18th amendment

December 2013

Contents

Acronyms

BEF	Baluchistan Education Foundation
BEMIS	Baluchistan Education Management Information System
BESP	Baluchistan Education Sector plan
CBOs	Community Based Organization
CPD	Continuous Professional development
ECE	Early Childhood Education
EFA	Education for All
ERC	Education Research Training
GoB	Government of Baluchistan
IDO	Innovative Development Organization
INGOs	International Non-Government Organizations
NGO	Non-Government organization
PPIU	Policy Planning and Implementation Unit
PTSMCs	Parent Teacher School Management Committee
SCSPEB	Society for Community Support for Primary Education in Baluchistan
SMAAJ	Society for Mobilization advocacy and justice
YMSESDO	Yar Muhammad Samejo Educational Society and Developmental Organization

Summary

Baluchistan Education Sector plan (BESP) is an enormous effort by the government of Baluchistan institutes, donors and NGOs. This document has been aimed as the first education policy document for the province of Baluchistan. Producing a complete policy document that will cater to the needs and requirements of a province may not be possible in first attempt. The policy document needs to have political ownership so that it can be made as Act. The document to the reader gives very general idea in some segments where it required being more specific.

The policy document has almost covered the objectives / activities or planning section, but how will these objectives / activities or planning be achieved in prescribed time frame have not been addressed.

Budget constraints will also not let the sector plan to accomplish set targets as it is 5% of total budget where 15% of the province's total budget may yield results to some extent.

In policy document (Baluchistan Education Sector Plan) resource and capacity assessment plan has not been clearly stated. In many segments of BESP capacity development plan for staff in education sub sectors is stated but training need assessment has not been considered.

Objectives of the Study

- To conduct a base line research study on the existing educational policy in Baluchistan
- To highlight the gaps in the existing policy that causes an hindrances to access to education for inhabitants living in Baluchistan or contrary to 18th Constitutional Amendment
- To come up with suggestions/recommendation to be incorporated while reforming the existing policy according to the 18th Constitutional Amendment in Baluchistan

Background

Education like other social sector is not an exception. Baluchistan has the lower literacy rate, highest gender gaps and weakest access indicators in the country. The quality of education also remains poor and the exponential growth of private schools in the province indicates the low levels of confidence in public sector schooling. Baluchistan has also not been the most favored province of the donors. This is partially due to the security situation but in case of the large donors the provincial policy of not accepting any loans has also reduced investment in all sectors from the donors. The policy may shrink funds for the time being but it will reduce potential expenditure burden in future.(Reference BESP pg 11)

The Department of education has undertaken some reforms over the last years. A policy Planning and implementation unit (PPIU) has been set up to coordinate the reforms. One of the stride of education department developed a Balochistan Action Plan. That served as interim education policy for the province till the development of full-fledged sector plan. The department of education and donors generated interest to develop BESP that embrace all the sub sectors ECE to higher education and technical and vocational education.

Community support program has been supported to enroll girls in the stream of education. Community has been involved under this process. The parent teacher school management committees, established through a democratic process efficiently managed their schools and now the government has decided to revive these organizations to improve the management of schools.

Baluchistan has no provincial education policy. Donors and different institutes of department of education have collectively made an enormous step to develop BESP. Department of education has committed to present the document in the provincial assembly of Baluchistan as a bill to pass it as a provincial educational policy. An important addition has been inclusion of Article 25A of the constitution that has made school education a fundamental right. Theoretically it is the extension of national education policy2009 although its status remains unclear after the 18th constitutional amendment that has devolved education to the provinces. The policy itself was prepared through a widespread consultative process with involvement of stakeholders from all over Pakistan.

SMAAJ as a consultant of YMSESDO has taken a research study to analyze that whether the BESP (has to be policy document) still has gaps or not. Along with available literatures (BESP, Curriculum) review tool based interviews has been conducted from concerned institutes of provincial education department and concerned NGOs, as

these institutes and NGOs has imparted in the consultative workshops of BESP development.

Methodology

A research study conducted has been based on two types of data

1. Secondary data (Literature review)
2. Primary data (Questionnaire of education department and School)

Initially National policy 2009, Curriculum policy 2006 and BESP 2013 to 2017 have been reviewed and gaps have been accentuated. Questions have been sorted to be placed whether in Education or school questionnaire. During the review gaps identified have been shared with educational concerned govt. departments and NGOs.

While review of BESP it has been anticipated that concerned govt. educational department and NGOs has the knowledge of all aspects / components education therefore consolidated tool / questionnaire has been developed but it has been observed that no individual office has complete knowledge all components. Data coming in questionnaire of education is incomplete because each department has only given inputs to its concerned subject.

For interview purpose two tools have been developed

1. Questionnaire of Education Department **(attached as annex 1)**
2. Questionnaire of School **(attached as annex 2)**

Questionnaire of education department has been developed to collect data from NGOs and institutes of department of education. Data collected from these institutes was acquired as per department / NGO own function/ working area. Quantitative data therefore could not been received as it was each department has only given inputs to its concerned subject.

Sample size has not been depicted by any formula because of its nature of questions that can only be answered by the specific department or NGOs. Each NGO / department has answered questions of their concerned functions or area. Graphs and charts were only possible if data in quantitative questions were received by all interviewees.

An unfortunate part of research was that school teachers and other staff could not answer any question because no teacher or other staff has imparted in any consultative workshop of policy nor had the capacity to respond on any question out of their knowledge. Due to that reason school questionnaire has unfortunately to be dropped

Government Institutions and INGOs and Local NGOs interviewed

Society for Community Support for Primary Education in Baluchistan (SCSPEB)

SCSPEB is working on education as implementing partner with known donors like UNICEF, CONCERN, Save the Children and many other international donors. SCSPEB is working in almost all the sectors / themes of education and at levels i.e. primary and secondary. SCSPEB has as an implementing partner contributed in developing the education sector plan (2013 -2017)

Education Research Center (ERC)

ERC is a research based organization that has done research on education focusing on student learning environment. ERC has a partnership with PTECH a federal institution working on technical skills. ERC has produced a English book based on 2006 national curriculum keeping in view the competencies, standards, benchmarks and Student learning outcome.

Baluchistan Education Management Information System (BEMIS)

BEMIS is responsible for managing the database / information of all Govt. Schools in province of Baluchistan.

Directorate of Education (Assistant Director)

Directorate of education is responsible for technical inputs to education department

Innovative Development Organization (IDO)

In education sector as an implementing partner with BEF, UNICEF, CONCERN and Save the children worked for improving education. IDO has established data centers in areas of interventions which is another MIS based mile stone achievement.

Baluchistan Education Foundation (BEF)

BEF has established almost 650 community based schools and where 24000 children are being bestowed by educational facilities

(Figures of schools and children have been provided by BEF**)**

CONCERN World Wide Baluchistan

Working to promote the life of poor by experimenting interventions in education, livelihood and many other themes

As Different Organizations were working in different themes of education, therefore questions relevant to the organization's field has only been asked.

Monitoring Policies for Implementation and Monitoring

An initial plan for monitoring and its implementation has been specified which covers the oversight monitoring but following are the gaps that needs to be consider in the policy documents also.

In Boluchistan Education Sector Plan two committees have been for monitoring have been suggested, oversight committee and technical committee. The structure and functions of the oversight committees have been described but the technical committee's structure and functions are missing.

Baluchistan Education Sector Plan has also specified donor's monitoring process but no modalities has been specified that how will the donor be selected and till what level should the donors support the process. How will be the process developed and reviewed.

Even if the Baluchistan Education Sector Plan gains political ownership and becomes policy document, it has been developed for 5 years only which has specific objectives and goals that need to be achieved, another effort will be required to develop policy document.

While suggesting training to teachers for taking part in monitoring mechanism teachers presence / regularity has not been addressed as in most of Baluchistan schools union enforcement is not letting even the school regular classes to be conduct.

Indicators should be designed in such a manner that should work in batch process model where lower level committee's monitoring tools indicators should give an input values to high level committee's monitoring tools, So single process will facilitate both committees and will be cost effective as well.

Consideration and reference of Baluchistan Education Sector Plan in other documents by Govt. institutes UN agencies INGOs and NGOs

BESP has not been marketed due to its pending status of political ownership due to that no organization refers it while producing its proposals to donors

Consultative Process of Baluchistan Education Sector Plan

Almost all subsectors of education and education department have been part of consultative process and also provided inputs in Baluchistan Education Sector Plan development. UNICEF, UNESCO and other local organization has also supported and contributed in both the phases of document (BESP) development.

GAP

While developing this document (BESP) research based organizations has not been enrolled due to which this section also lacks feasible strategies.

Suggestions

National and international consultants / firms having research in different sectors of education can be on board to develop such strategies that can help in letting a research that yields the required results.

Baluchistan Education Sector Plan (BESP) be implemented in its true letter & spirit

Gap

The BESP lacks in explaining the issues like how will the political / union enforcement be addressed while implementing the objectives.

Lack of coordination and implementation has been observed among the Govt. institutes due to which the implementation is hindered

Suggestions

If the budget be increased from 5% to 15% it may be possible to achieve in its higher extent.

If proper coordination and implementation mechanism is developed and notified, then achievement of many strategies is possible.

Baluchistan Education Sector Plan (BESP) as resources bound

GAP

Implementing curriculum in complete shape requires audio video visuals, internet, Cards and other materials that may be possible in urban areas but in remote rural areas of Baluchistan where paucity of electricity and computer literacy still prevails, how can such suggested standards be implemented.

Teachers having capacity to teach according to modern tools and techniques prefers to be in urban areas where they find opportunities of earning after school timings, which again let the teacher of less capacity to accept posts in remote rural areas.

Baluchistan Education Sector Plan (BESP) as theoretical aspect to practical aspect

GAP

Frame works suggested in BESP to be developed require analysis and assessment of real scenario until a true picture has not been received frame works that serves the purpose of achieving result may not be possible.

Suggestions

A thorough analysis and assessment and practical operational plans can also transact the BESP from theoretical aspect to practical aspect.

Parents visit should also add marks in student result and an award should be announced which will work as positive reinforcement on the parents. Students whom parents are not taking interest will him / herself reinforce parents to visit the school.

Education as a social phenomenon

GAP

Majority of the parents in rural areas are not literate and are unaware of education importance, due to that the child also remains ignorant about the importance of education. Teachers also fail to realize to the student about the importance of education. BESP has not considered that aspect of the communities that hinders the child's education.

Primary Education in Mother Tongue

GAP

BESP has developed a strategy that a primary education will be provided in mother tongue but it has not mentioned that local languages are sometime not so much developed that it can help the student be educated in that language. BESP has also not mentioned that if the student may want to continue his / her education then how that student can be readjusted in other language (English / Urdu) system. If all modalities are missing it is an extra book in the bag of the student.

Improve Quality Education

Curriculum

Baluchistan education sector plan has depicted national curriculum policy 2006. This curriculum is student learning outcome based. Curriculum develops standards for the text books and other reading material which helps in student quick understanding and learning. Curriculum has also specified internet usage and other computer applications by the student so that student can easily grasp the concept of the topics.

Education directorate stated that 16 out of 67 subject books have so far been published and ready for students to be read.

GAP

It has been noticed that such resources are not possible be provided in remote districts where neither a computer literate is available who can troubleshoot the problem of computer or repair it in case of any malfunctioning.

The Directorate of education has no writer of any subject so far due to that writing a book of any subject seems difficult. Training provision or capacity building of the same

staff may not acquire the skill of writing a book according to national curriculum policy 2006.

No meetings have been conducted since January 2012 regarding coordination as stated by interviewees.

No capacity development plan has still developed so that Govt. staff gains the skill of at least reviewing the text books developed under national policy 2006.

Frame work for capacity development has still not been developed and shared with the stakeholders and local organizations.

BESP has depicted bloom's taxonomy for developing curriculum. A good learning process teaches the child all of the various levels of learning from knowledge to evaluation, but the system prevails in the province is that no teacher is well aware regarding pyramid of blooms taxonomy due to that teachers are not capable of delivering to the students up to the mark.

No feedback mechanism framework has so far been found among the Govt offices responsible of curriculum development and implementation (Bureau of Curriculum) and text book writing and publishing (Baluchistan Text Book Board).

Suggestions

National and International consultants should be hired to assess the situation of each district and not only provide its feedback in development of textbooks but also help in developing and implementing the text books in the districts.

In Service teacher training and pre service teachers training

Teachers' professional development is an essential aspect of quality education but in the present scenario teachers lacks in interest of development but is willing to have training only for getting TA/DA. It has been observed that many primary school teachers are always absent and education department faces the challenge of making these teachers regular to attend his / her classes.

Baluchistan Education Sector Plan has planned to provide training to in service teachers and pre service teachers but until and unless the books are in publishing and reviewing phase no training can be planned for the teachers. Provincial Institute for Teachers Education (PITE) is responsible for developing training material and training frame works.

GAP

Conducting baseline study requires information of all the teachers along with subject specialty or subject assigned by authority. Baluchistan Education Management Information System (BEMIS) has the information of all teachers but the database cannot clearly figure it out that how many teachers are of each subject.

School Environment

Quality education includes factors that help in an environment of school where child / student feels relaxed and focused on study and learning. Elements that derail the focus of child / student are ill teaching methods, corporal punishments and class room physical design where a child finds nothing of interest, on the other hand private schools has section of children where child play with toys that attracts the attention of child and develop his interest day by day.

GAP

Plan/ Policy document (BESP) could not state any mechanism where students have the right to object in case of any miss conduct against him or her. Only awareness may inform the parents and the students but missing of mechanism will not help in discouraging such acts.

Plan/ Policy document (BESP) commits student friendly school design but no design has so far observed in implementation or designing phase.

Suggestions

Any private schools system that prevails in city may be replicated as model initially. The process will gradually intimate the gaps that will be suggested and excel in further processes.

Early Childhood Education

Plan/ Policy document (BESP) has declared kacchi as ECE which again is weak model as early education for child.

GAP

ECE material is not still designed and the teachers have not been trained on the designed material.

Suggestions

Any private schools system of ECE that prevails in city may be replicated as model initially. The process will gradually intimate the gaps that will be suggested and excel in further processes.

Access and Equity

Plan/ Policy document (BESP) planned to pay stipends to the children enrolled in schools. The Plan/ Policy document (BESP) has not specified that what the number of boys and girls is attending school. Census information may play vital role in concretely calculating the required financial figure for stipends but as far as the budget of education is concerned it cannot accommodate paying stipends to students that are enrolled in school and that will be enrolled in schools when come to know about stipends distribution.

Community schools model are most cheapest models but at the same time proved effective and efficient method of implementing education in the areas where construction and teachers appointment is a question, but no frame work of training for these teachers still have been developed. Baluchistan Education Foundation (BEF) has established almost 650 schools in remote communities in Baluchistan but Govt. has failed to induct these teachers under its umbrella.

School teachers are also interviewed but no one was aware about any process of development of Plan/ Policy document (BESP). ECE section is still missing in schools. Teachers are trained but by donors only. Plan/ Policy document (BESP) has in its objectives to train the teachers but this has been planned in 2014 and 2015.

List of Offices (Department of education Baluchistan and NGOs) interviewed

1. Society for Community Support for Primary Education in Baluchistan (SCSPEB)
2. ERC
3. BEMIS
4. Directorate of education
5. IDO
6. BEF
7. Concerned World Wide Pakistan
8. PPIU
9. Education Department Secretariat

Annex 1

Form No_____

Date: -

G.1 Name of Organization / institution

G.2 Name/s of the interviewers and Designations

S No	Name	Designation	Signature
1			
2			
3			
4			
5			

G.3 Is there any Educational policy document that your organization is using? 1. Yes 2. No (if Yes Name it)

OR

In case of Individual or NGO Name the education policy been used or referred in your proposals or documents

G.4 Have you or your organization / institute been invited for any of education policy document development workshop or any consultative process 1. Yes 2. No (if yes have you done any homework?

G.5 Will the document/Education Policy be implemented in its true letter & spirit? If no what can be done to achieve it?

G.6 Is the policy resources bound, as resources are different in different areas? 1.Yes 2.No (How can this problem be solved) Providing Good teachers computers to far areas has been experienced as not possible

G.7 How to make this policy document from theoretical aspect to practical aspect? The What part is there but how part is missing

G.8 Can you please tell me how well is the how part answered? Has it covered all the aspects so far?

G.9 Education is a social phenomenon, where individual educates community and community educates individual is there any strategy for that

G.10 Educationist says primary education must be in mother tongue transfer of teachers from one area to another results in cultural conflicts in school environmental

1.1 Improve Quality Education

1.1.1 Curriculum (Ref 7.2.3)

Responsibility

Bureau of Curriculum and Coordination Organizations / Institutions (BISE, BTBB, PITE, DOS and DOC)

Questions

Q.E.1 Is there any policy available for curriculum development? As 2006 policy is national policy **1.Yes 2. No** Any process is undertaking for policy making

Q.E.2 How many times has the coordination meeting taken place for the said policy development?

Q.E.3 What is the status of policy development?

Q.E.4 What is the status of CIF if any (Curriculum Implementation Frame-work)

Q.E.5 Any capacity development plan developed for education department or other stakeholders or your office 1. Yes 2. No. (if yes explain what are the CDP)

Q.E.6 Any training material developed for training of teachers and other organization / institutions staff training / development regarding curriculum.

Q.E.7 What is most effective student learning process in your view?

If learning process is not applied then why is it not applied?

1.1.2 Text Books (Ref 7.3)

Responsibilities

BTBB in coordination with BOC

Questions

T.B.1 Have the standards for text books been developed 1. Yes 2.No if not then what status is till date

T.B.2 If yes under which policy

T.B.3 How language issues addressed in the text books as sector plan is reinforcing education in mother tongue

T.B.4 Any feedback mechanism available for in-cooperating new policy reforms Please specify one

1.1.3 In Service teacher training

Responsibility

PITE

Questions

I.T.T.1 Any continuous professional development program undertaken

I.T.T.2 Any baseline study still conducted that can assess the teachers capacity/ capability 1.Yes 2.No

I.T.T.3 Have the teachers training database been designed as specified in BESP 1. Yes 2.No

1.1.4 Pre Service Teacher Training (7.5)

Questions

P.T.T.1 Any Standard of training for pre service teacher training developed as stated in policy (BESP)

1.1.5 School Environment

Responsibility

Question

S.E.1 Any awareness campaign planned for reforms in improving school environment and corporal punishment

1.1.6 Early Childhood Education (7.10)

E.C.E.1 Any Child friendly school design so far or plan is available (ECE)

2.1 Access and Equity

Questions

A.E.1 How will the stipends be distributed among the students and is there any budget estimated for that

A.E.2 In order to provide a school to boys and girls census information is helpful. How is education Department planning to provide schools to girls and boys where census data is missing?

A.E.3 Community School approach has been depicted by plan/policy. How education department is accommodating training of local teachers having education then mentioned criteria.

A.E.4 Community School approach has been depicted by plan/policy. How education department is accommodating of schools from department behalf.

Annex 2

Date

Schools Form

S.1 Name of School

S.2 Person interviewed Name Designation and signature

Name	Designation

S.3 Do you know what education policy is education department using 1.Yes 2. No (if Yes please explain)

S.4 Have you been part of any assessment or consultative process pertaining to the draft of new policy document or reforms 1. Yes 2. No (If yes explain)

S.5 Do your school has ECE facility (Kacchi pakki) (the survey person will visit the classes kachi and pakki and give his remarks on form) 1. Yes   2. No

S.5.1. How is the condition of the class?

S.5.2. How is the environment of the class?

S.6 Have the teachers been trained on SLO (student learning outcome)?

S.7 Is there any training manual available in the school?

S.8 Is there any new criteria for monitoring of school provided or trained the relevant staff on such subject?